# **Appendix**

# **Further Reading and Resources**

There is an extensive literature of theological work related to the abuse crisis in the Catholic Church, both in books and in journal articles. Most of the journal articles, including many of those cited in this research, are behind paywalls or require institutional access, usually through a university library. The titles below are all either available by open access, with no charge, or can be ordered online for modest costs.

The books, journal articles and Catholic teaching texts cited in the endnotes are not repeated here.

#### **Memoirs from Survivors**

Stephen Bernard, Paper Cuts: A memoir (London: Jonathan Cape, 2019)

Graham Caveney, The Boy with Perpetual Nervousness: A Memoir of an Adolescence (London: Picador, 2017)

Brian Devlin, *Cardinal Sin: Challenging power abuse in the Catholic Church* (Dublin: Columba Books, 2021) https://www.rootandbranchsynod.org/stolen-lives

Peter Murray, Swimming with Medusa: One man's journey through abuse to hope (Burleigh, Australia: Zeus Publications, 2014)

## An external perspective

Richard Scorer, Betrayed: *The English Catholic Church and the Sex Abuse Crisis* (London: Biteback Publishing, 2014)

#### A bishop's response to the abuse crisis

Bishop Geoffrey Robinson, Confronting Power and Sex in the Catholic Church: Reclaiming the Spirit of Jesus (Dublin: Columba Press, 2007)

#### The experience of priests

Barry O'Sullivan, The Burden of Betrayal: Non-Offending Priests and the Clergy Sexual Abuse Scandals (Gracewing, 2018)

### Other theological writing

Daniel J Fleming, James F. Keenan SJ and Hans Zolner SJ, (eds.) Doing Theology and Theological Ethics in the Face of the Abuse Crisis (Eugene, Oregon: Pickwick Publications, 2023) The complete book is open access, i.e. available to download from the Catholic Theological Ethics for a World Church website:

Doing Theology and Theological Ethics in the Face of the Abuse Crisis (Complete Book) | Published in Journal of Moral Theology (scholasticahq.com)

Bradford E. Hinze, Confronting a Church in Controversy, (New York: Paulist Press, 2022)

Richard Lennan, Seeking the Right Side of History: Theology and the Sexual Abuse Crisis. Lecture given at Villanova University. November 2019

200304+-+PAPER+-+IAG+Governance+Symposium+-+Richard+Lennan.pdf (squarespace.com)

"Seeking the Right Side of History: Theology & the Sex Abuse Crisis" - YouTube

Shelley Rambo, Resurrecting Wounds: Living in the Afterlife of Trauma (Waco, Texas: Baylor University Press, 2017)

# On prevention and pastoral care and support

Jane Chevous, Laura Fischer, Concetta Perôt, Angela Sweeney, *Safe, Seen, Supported: How to help and reach children and young people experiencing abuse in their households* (March 2021) available at

SafeSeenSupôportedReport\_JC-LF-CP-AS.pdf (survivorsvoices.org)

See also the *Survivor Involvement Ladder* developed by Survivors Voices **Survivor Involvement Ladder - Survivors Voices** 

Brendan Geary, Child Sexual Abuse: What is it? How should it be dealt with? What is a Christian response? (Suffolk: Kevin Mayhew Pubs, 2009)

Joanne Marie Greer and Brendan Geary (eds.) The Dark Night of the Catholic Church: Examining the Child Sexual Abuse Scandal (Suffolk: Kevin Mayhew Pubs, 2011)

Sarah Nelson, *Tackling Child Sexual Abuse: Radical Approaches to Prevention, Protection and Support.* (Bristol: Policy Press, 2016).

## Resources to use in groups

Stolen Lives is a project from Root and Branch, a forum and movement for reform in the Catholic Church. See Home | Root & Branch Synod (rootandbranchsynod.org) for an explanation of the movement itself and follow the links to the Stolen Lives webpages. Root and Branch have produced a valuable learning resource available here Stolen Lives Learning Resource publication copy.pdf

The resources from the Isaiah Journey have already been mentioned several times in the report: see The Isaiah Journey - Catholic Bishops' Conference (cbcew.org.uk) for all their material.

# Reports on the child abuse crisis in the Catholic Church and Catholic institutions in other countries

#### Scotland

Bishops' Conference of Scotland: Statistical Review of non-recent Cases of Abuse. An analysis of Religious records from 1943 to 2005 (February 2018)

See **Safeguarding (bcos.org.uk)** for statistical reports including this title as well as reviews of safeguarding policy and practice.

#### France

Independent Commission on Sexual Abuse in the Church (CIASE): Final Report (October 2021)
Also known as the Sauvé Report A 32 page summary in English is available at
Final Report - Independent Commission on Sexual Abuse in the Church (ciase.fr)

As a result of the report, the French bishops set up the National Authority for Recognition and Reparation (INIRR), an independent body which works to offer financial reparations and restorative measures to the victims. See <a href="https://international.la-croix.com/news/ethics/sexual-violence-addressing-the-emergencies-within-the-church-in-france/18686">https://international.la-croix.com/news/ethics/sexual-violence-addressing-the-emergencies-within-the-church-in-france/18686</a>

# Ireland

Commission of Investigation: Report into the Catholic Archdiocese of Dublin, July 2009 (The Murphy Report)

C-04 Murphy Report Entire Ireland - DocumentCloud

Commission to Inquire into Child Abuse (Dublin: Government Publications, 2009) also known as the Ryan Report)

The Commission to Inquire into Child Abuse (childabusecommission.ie)

#### **USA**

Karen J. Terry, Margaret Leland, Katarina Schuth OSF, Brenda Vollman, Christina Massey, The Causes and Context of Sexual Abuse of Minors by Catholic Priests in the United States, 1950-2010: A Report Presented to the United States Conference of Catholic Bishops by the John Jay College Research Team (2011), available at

The-Causes-and-Context-of-Sexual-Abuse-of-Minors-by-Catholic-Priests-in-the-United-States-1950-2010.pdf (usccb.org)

#### Australia

Royal Commission into Institutional Responses to Child Sexual Abuse: *Analysis of Claims of Child Sexual Abuse Made with Respect to Catholic Church Institutions in Australia* (2017) available at

Research Report - Analysis of complaints of child sexual abuse made with respect to Catholic Church Institutions in Australia - Institutions of Interest (childabuseroyalcommission.gov.au)

# **Notes**

- Pope Francis, Vos estis lux mundi
   Apostolic Letter in the form of "Motu Proprio" of the Supreme Pontiff Francis "Vos estis lux mundi" (Updated) (25 March 2023) | Francis (vatican.va) p.1.
- For more details of the members of both bodies, see Boundary Breaking - Durham University.
- 3. A safeguarding plan aims to ensure that those about whom there are concerns or where allegations have been made or who have been convicted of relevant offences against children or adults and have served their sentences, are supervised and supported. They are agreements which identify risks and set in place strategies to manage these. For more information, see the Practice Guidance section of the CSSA website;
  Practice Guidance (catholicsafeguarding.org.uk)
- 4. A separate report on the research methodology will be published later.
- 5. The Charter for Engaging Survivors Survivors Voices
- Pope Francis, "Evangelii Gaudium": Apostolic Exhortation on the Proclamation of the Gospel in Today's World (24 November 2013) | Francis (vatican.va)
- 7. See p.134 for an explanation of synodality.
- 8. See the appendix for examples.
- 9. National Catholic Safeguarding Commission (NCSC) Annual Report 2015 p.35.
- 10. NCSC Annual Report 2019. p.32.
- 11. NCSC Annual Report 2018 p.66.
- 12. NCSC Annual Report 2019.p.33.
- 13. Stephen Bullivant, Allegations of child sexual abuse in the Catholic Church in England and Wales between 1970 and 2015: A Statistical Summary, Allegations of Child Sexual Abuse in the Catholic Church in England and Wales between 1970 and 2015: A Statistical Summary St Mary's University Open Research Archive (stmarys.ac.uk)
- 14. Bullivant, p.18.
- 15. Bullivant, p.26.
- This is a wider trend. See Massimo Faggioli and Mary Catherine O'Reilly-Gindhart. 2021.
   'A New Wave in the Modern History of the Abuse Crisis in the Catholic Church: Literature Overview, 2018–2020', *Theological Studies*, Vol. 82 (1) 156–85.
- 17. Integrity in Ministry Religious Life Safeguarding Service (religioussafeguarding.org)
- Ian Elliott and others, Independent Review of Safeguarding Structures and Arrangements in the Catholic Church in England and Wales (Elliott Review) Independent Review Safeguarding Report 2020 Re-Format 4 (cbcew.org.uk) pp.72-5.
- 19. Elliott Review, pp. 6-7.
- 20. See Home cssa (catholicsafeguarding.org.uk) and Religious Life Safeguarding Service (religioussafeguarding.org)
- 21. Elliott Review, p.47.
- 22. National Tribunal Service (NTS) Catholic Bishops' Conference (cbcew.org.uk)
- 23. Caring-Safely-For-Others.pdf (cbcew.org.uk)
- 24. Prayer for Survivors of Abuse 2023 Catholic Bishops' Conference (cbcew.org.uk)
- 25. NCSC Annual Report 2019, p.17.
- 26. Apostolic Letter in the form of "Motu Proprio" of the Supreme Pontiff Francis "Vos estis lux mundi" (7 May 2019) | Francis (vatican.va)
- See, for example, Christopher Lamb, Fr Hans Zollner resigns from child protection body (thetablet.co.uk) 29<sup>th</sup> March 2023, and an interview with Baroness Sheila Hollins at Home | Root & Branch Synod (rootandbranchsynod.org)

- 28. IICSA, *The Roman Catholic Church: Investigation Report* (November 2020)

  The Roman Catholic Church:Safeguarding in the Roman Catholic Church in England and Wales (cbcew.org.uk)
- 29. Roman Catholic Church Investigation Report, p.122.
- 30. Safeguarding Catholic Bishops' Conference (cbcew.org.uk)
- 31. See George B. Wilson SJ, *Clericalism: The Death of Priesthood* (Collegeville: Liturgical Press, 2008), Chapters One and Two, for a fuller explanation.
- This was the case even though this research was carried out within the CCS, which is independent of the Church but works collaboratively and constructively with many Catholic institutions.
- 33. See Lovett, Coy and Kelly, *Deflection, denial and disbelief*. The authors note that although this was a 'popular' theory in the 1980s and 90s, there was a lack of clear evidence to support it. P.9
- 34. Margaret Farley, *Just Love: A Framework for Christian Sexual Ethics* (New York: Continuum, 2006) p. 209.
- 35. Marcus Meschler, 'Clergy Sexual Abuse as Moral Injury: Confronting a Wounded and Wounding Church' in Daniel J. Fleming, James F. Keenan SJ and Hans Zollner SJ (eds.) *Doing Theology and Theological Ethics in the Face of the Abuse Crisis,* (Eugene, Oregon: Pickwick Publications, 2023) 122-149 p.122.
- Marcus Meschler, Kandi Stinson, Anne Fuller, Ashley Theuring, Measuring and Exploring Moral Injury Caused by Clergy Sexual Abuse. (Xavier University, 2022)
  - Xavier (Cincinnati): Measuring Moral Injury Taking Responsibility (fordham.edu)
- 37. The Catholic Parish: Institutional Discipline, Tribal Identity and Religious Development: (London: Sheed and Ward, 1996) p.104.
- 38. Synodality is explained on p.134
- 39. Documents and Publications Catholic Bishops' Conference (cbcew.org.uk)
- 40. It is a limitation that we were not able to listen to more deacons. It would have been desirable.
- 41. A celebret is a letter from a bishop or a provincial leader of a religious congregation which confirms that a priest is in good standing with the Church. It may be required if a priest wishes to celebrate the Eucharist in another diocese or country.
- 42. See Chapter One for explanations of the Nolan Review, the One Church approach and the Valladolid meeting
- 43. Pope John Paul II, Pastores Gregis: Post-Synodal Apostolic Exhortation on the Bishop, Servant of the Gospel of Jesus Christ for the Hope of the World, (2003) Pastores gregis (October 16, 2003) | John Paul II (vatican.va) para. 22.
- 44. The Nolan Report is explained in Chapter One.
- 45. Other research shows that there is a low rate of recidivism among male sex offenders who have received treatment for their offences.
- 46. See Chapter One for more details.
- 47. To protect anonymity, in this section we use only the generic terms 'office-holders' and 'leaders', to cover this group.
- 48. The names and ciphers (IICSA codes) of those requested to supply documentation or witness statements can be found on pp 139-142 of the IICSA Report on the Catholic Church. They include twenty-five bishops and priests, at least twenty-five safeguarding volunteers and staff and thirty-five 'complainants' (survivors).
- 49. The Elliot Review recommendations are explained in more detail on p.86
- Catholic Council for the IICSA Recommendations Action Plan, available at Microsoft Word -2021.04.30 - IICSA Recommendations - Response Paper FINAL.docx (cbcew.org.uk)
- 51. Bullivant, p.9.
- 52. Bullivant prefaces his analysis with cautions about 'the problematic nature of *all* statistics', noting that researchers stress that a large proportion of abuse is never reported and that Catholic data from dioceses and religious orders is often scanty or incomplete. pp.6-7.
- 53. Bullivant, p.10.
- 54. NCSC Annual Report, 2019, p.24.
- 55. See the Dogmatic Constitution on the Church from the Second Vatican Council, Lumen Gentium (1964), paras. 40 and 42 **Lumen gentium (vatican.va)** and Pope Francis, *Gaudete et*

- Exsultate (2018) paras.6-18. "Gaudete et exsultate": Apostolic Exhortation on the call to holiness in today's world (19 March 2018) | Francis (vatican.va)
- CSSA Audit Reports (catholicsafeguarding.org.uk) The report was commissioned by Archbishop Malcolm McMahon following the resignation of Bishop Byrne in December 2022, and published in June 2023.
- 57. Home | Grief to Grace (grieftograceuk.org)
- 58. Safe Spaces England and Wales Safe Spaces England and Wales
- 59. Religious Life Safeguarding Service (religioussafeguarding.org)
- 60. The Isaiah Journey Catholic Bishops' Conference (cbcew.org.uk)

  The resources provided by the group include material for use on the Day of Prayer and for other forms of pastoral and spiritual response to victims and survivors of abuse. The group's members include people with liturgical and other expertise, religious and survivors.
- 61. Bernard G. Prusak, 'Who Knew? The sexual-abuse crisis and 'epistemic injustice'. Commonweal, October 10, 2022 Who Knew? | Commonweal Magazine
- 62. Brendan Geary, 'Witnesses in a fragmented world' in *Open House* **Open House Scotland - Online Magazine December 2019.**
- 63. Lovett, Coy and Kelly, Deflection, denial and disbelief, p.6.
- 64. IICSA, I will be heard, I will be heard | IICSA Independent Inquiry into Child Sexual Abuse p.87-88. Only 5 per cent of victims experienced that they were believed.
- 65. See *Practice Guidance Management of Concerns and Allegations*, CSSA **Practice Guidance (catholicsafeguarding.org.uk)** pp.1, 5, detailing other actions that must be taken.
- 66. Julie Hanlon Rubio and Paul J. Schutz, Beyond Bad Apples: Understanding Clergy Perpetrated Sexual Abuse as a Structural Problem and Cultivating Strategies for Change. Beyond Bad Apples - Ignatian Center - Santa Clara University (scu.edu) p. 5.
- Address by Pope Francis at the Opening of the Synod of Bishops on Young People, the Faith and Vocational Discernment (October 3, 2018). http://w2.vatican.va/content/ francesco/en/speeches/2018/october/documents/papa-francesco\_20181003\_aperturasinodo.html
- 68. Nicholas Senz, 'What is 'Clericalism'? *Aleteia*, 23.08.2018. **What is "clericalism?" (aleteia.** org)
- 69. Thomas G. Plante, 'Clericalism Contributes to Religious, Spiritual, and Behavioral Struggles among Catholic Priests' *Religions* 11, 217 (2020), p.2.
- 70. Final Report of the Royal Commission into Institutional Responses to Child Sexual Abuse (Barton, ACT: Commonwealth of Australia, 2017) p.68. Cited by Gerard A. Arbuckle in Abuse and Cover-Up: Refounding the Catholic Church in Trauma (New York: Orbis Books, 2019), p. 50-51.
- 71. Marie Keenan, Child Sexual Abuse and the Catholic Church, p. 42.
- 72. E. T. Vasko, *Beyond Apathy: A theology for bystanders*. (Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2015) p.22.
- 73. National Synthesis of the People of God in the United States of America for the Diocesan Phase of the 2021-2023 Synod, released Sept. 19th 2022
  - US National Synthesis 2021-2023 Synod.pdf (usccb.org) p.6.
- 74. The theme of accountability is also relevant to bishops and is considered separately later. It is also relevant to deacons, but there was no material in our data that connected clericalism to permanent deacons.
- 75. Appendix 1 (no page number). Documents and Publications Catholic Bishops' Conference (cbcew.org.uk)
- Caring Safely for Others; Pastoral Standards and Safe Conduct in Ministry (2020)
   Documents and Publications Catholic Bishops' Conference (cbcew.org.uk) p.8.
- 77. See the Appendix for examples.
- 78. Catholic bishops are required to present a report on their dioceses to the Holy See every five years and to visit Rome to meet the Pope and the officials in various departments or dicasteries. Normally the bishops of England and Wales make this visit together.
- 79. In their comprehensive report on governance and management in the Church, The Light from the Southern Cross: Promoting Co-Responsible Governance in the Catholic Church in Australia, the Australian bishops make this point, but also note indications that the practice may be changing. Available at The+Light+from+the+Southern+Cross+FINAL+(15+August+2020).pdf (squarespace.com) See p.64.

- 80. James F. Keenan, in 'Hierarchicalism' in *Theological Studies* 83.1 (2022) 84-108, cites a canon lawyer, John Beal, to validate this point. See p.101.
- 81. Elliott Review, p.14.
- 82. Elliott Review, p.14.
- Code of Canon Law, available at Code of Canon Law: Table of Contents (vatican.va) See canons 381.391
- 84. The Motu Proprio was confirmed, extended and made permanent in 2023.
- 85. James F. Keenan, 'Hierarchicalism', p.99. The pontifical secret is a rule of confidentiality which binds some office-holders in the Catholic hierarchy to secrecy on certain matters such as the appointment of bishops. It has been controversial as it has also covered penal processes for cases of sexual abuse. In 2019, Pope Francis decreed that the pontifical secret should no longer apply in cases of clerical sexual abuse. See Pope Francis lifts pontifical secret from legal proceedings of abuse trials of clerics | Catholic News Agency The text of the decree is here RESCRIPTUM EX AUDIENTIA SS.MI: Rescriptum of the Holy Father Francis to promulgate the Instruction on the confidentiality of legal proceedings (vatican.va)
- 86. The Chairman of the Bishops' Conference is elected by the Conference and does not have power to compel any other bishop to take any particular action other than by persuasion and influence. The Bishops' Conference as a body can make binding decisions which apply to all its members only in certain specific areas defined in canon law.
- 87. Preparatory Document for the 16th Ordinary General Assembly of the Synod of Bishops (vatican.va) para 6. The sources cited in the extract are found in the online text but not repeated here.
- 88. Translated by Sr.Sergia Englund OCD (San Francisco: Ignatius Press, 1982) p.91.
- 89. Synod: Fr Ormond Rush's theological reflection on Synthesis Report Vatican News
  The sources cited in the text are found in the online text but not repeated here.
- 90. Lumen Gentium, para 56.
- 91. Synod Preparatory Document, para 2.
- 92. https://www.synod.va/en/what-is-the-synod-21-24/about.html
- 93. Elliott Report, pp 6-8.
- 94. Elliott Report, p.6.
- 95. Pope John Paul II, Reconciliatio et Paenitentia (1984) Reconciliatio et Paenitentia (December 2, 1984) | John Paul II (vatican.va) para 16.
- 96. Pope John Paul II, Ut Unum Sint (1995) Ut Unum Sint (25 May 1995) | John Paul II (vatican. va) para. 34.
- Lumen Gentium, para. 8, Catechism of the Catholic Church, para. 827 Catechism of the Catholic Church (vatican.va)
- 98. Catechism of the Catholic Church para. 827.
- 99. Francis Sullivan, 'Do the sins of its members affect the holiness of the Church.' in Michael S Attridge and Jarolsav Z. Skira (eds.) In God's Hands (Leuven: Peeters Publishers, 2006). Sullivan points out that traditional answers to the question about whether the holiness of the Church is affected by the sins of its members are unsatisfactory. He quotes Karl Rahner's critical response to the idea that even when its members sin, the Church herself remains holy; 'The Church ... is somehow, without its being noticed, "hypostatised", she becomes almost like an independent existent "entity" which stands as teacher and guide over against the people of God; she does not appear to be this people of God itself... in its actual state of pilgrimage'. p.267
- 100. Sullivan p.268.
- 101. See Chapter Four, 'Human Dignity and the Question of Social and Structural Sin' in Anna Rowlands, Towards a Politics of Communion: Catholic Social Teaching in Dark Times (London: T and T Clark, 2021) especially p.106.
- 102. Fratelli tutti, Fratelli tutti (3 October 2020) | Francis (vatican.va) para. 215.
- 103. James Keenan, 'Vulnerability and Hierarchicalism' in *Melita Theologica, Journal of the Faculty of Theology, University of Malta,* 68/2 (2018) 129-142. p.137.
- 104. Fratelli Tutti, para. 69.
- 105. *Fratelli Tutti*, para. 67.
- 106. Christifideles Laici (December 30, 1988) | John Paul II (vatican.va)

- 107. Evangelii Gaudium, para. 102.
- 108. Code of Canon Law, Code of Canon Law: Table of Contents (vatican.va) canon 536.
- 109. Lumen Gentium, para. 28.
- 110. Austin Flannery OP (ed.) Vatican Council II: The Conciliar and Post-Conciliar Documents (Dublin: Dominican Publications, 1975) p.361.
- 111. Excerpt from the English translation of *Ordination of a Bishop, of Priests and of Deacons* © 2018, International Commission on English in the Liturgy Corporation. All Rights Reserved. The inclusion of the phrase about forming a priestly people is new in the revised 2018 edition; it was not in the previous edition. The new edition is due to be published in 2024.
- 112. Pastores Dabo Vobis (PDV) Pastores Dabo Vobis (March 15, 1992) | John Paul II (vatican.va) para.
- 113. PDV, para. 15.
- 114. PDV, paras.15,16.
- 115. CCC. para. 1548, citing other teaching texts.
- 116. PDV, para 14.
- 117. PDV, para 17.
- 118. Keenan, Hierarchicalism, p.95
- 119. See Chapter One for an explanation of Vos estis lux mundi.
- 120. Enda McDonagh, Vulnerable to the Holy (Dublin: Columba Press, 2004) p.32
- 121. See, for example, Bishop John Arnold's homily on the occasion of 40 years of priesthood; Bishop John Arnold reflects on 40 years of priesthood | ICN (indcatholicnews.com) or Bishop Stephen Wright Installed as Fifteenth Bishop of Hexham Newcastle Diocese of Hexham & Newcastle (diocesehn.org.uk)
- 122. Massimo Faggioli, 'Apparent Victory, Actual Defeat? Vatican II Ecclesiology of Episcopacy' in *Josephinum Journal of Theology* 26:1-2, (2019), pp. 51-61.
- 123. Faggioli, p.58.
- 124. Faggioli, pp.57-8.
- 125. Faggioli, p.61.
- 126. Walter Kasper, 'Amt und Gemeinde', originally published in Walter Kasper, *Glaube und Geschichte*, (Mainz: M. Grünewald, 1970), 388-414. Reprinted in Walter Kasper, Die Kirche und ihre Ämter: Shriften zur Ekklesiologie II, (Freiburg: Herder, 2009) pp. 38-68 (p.55). English translation by Adrian Brooks.
- 127. Richard R. Gaillardetz, 'A Church in Crisis: How did we get here? How do we move forward?' in Worship 93 (2019), 204-224.p. 210. Gaillardetz also makes a link between distinct clerical identity and theologies that might problematize it: 'This near obsession with a distinctive identity, one encountered among some clergy and seminarians, is often grounded in a problematic theology of Holy Orders. That theology assumes that ordination confers, in a quasi-magical fashion, ministerial competency the *ordinand* did not possess prior to ordination.' p. 209.
- 128. Matthew 22:37-40.
- 129. See Pope Benedict XVI, Compendium of the Catechism of the Catholic Church (1995) para 336. Compendium of the Catechism of the Catholic Church (vatican.va)
- 130. Code of Canon Law, Canon 276 para 1.
- 131. Cf. Apostolorum Successores §2, §33, §43 & §97; Presbyterorum Ordinis §15, Pope St Paul VI, 1965; The Priest, Pastor and Leader of the Parish Community §12, Congregation for Clergy, 2002; Directory for the Ministry and Life of Permanent Deacons §8, §38, §45, §47, §49, & §69, Congregation for Catholic Education, 1998. Text quoted is from CSFO p.8
- 132. Archbishop Scicluna is a canon lawyer who held the role of Promotor of Justice in the Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith in the Vatican, where he has led work to reform how canon law dealt with child sexual abuse. He has also been asked by the Pope to investigate how the bishops have responded to abuse cases in certain regions. He is now the Archbishop of Malta and still plays a leading role in reforms related to abuse and mishandling. James Keenan reports this response to a lecture Keenan gave in Malta at Scicluna's request. See Keenan, Hierarchicalism, p.97
- 133. See John Paul II, Christifideles Laici para. 55.
- 134. Appendix 1 (no page number given).
- 135. Salving the Vast Wounds That Remain From the Abuse Crisis | Church Life Journal | University

- of Notre Dame July 07, 2023.
- 136. See Myriam Wijlens, 'Synodality implies accountability. Accountability requires a synodal church' in *Studia Canonica* 56/2 (2022) 413-439.
- 137. This is one of the practices adopted during some synodal listening processes. Rather than just assert that some matters cannot be discussed as Catholic teaching is developed at the level of the Pope and his offices in the Vatican, those gathering the outcomes of synodal listening have noted these contentious matters including when they disagree with current teaching and included them in what is fed into the wider Synod process.
- 138. Statement on Safeguarding Catholic Bishops' Conference (cbcew.org.uk) November 2020.
- 139. See Bishop Stephen Wright Installed 15th Bishop of Hexham and Newcastle Catholic Bishops' Conference (cbcew.org.uk) and Patrick Hudson, Abuse survivors speak out at bishop's installation (thetablet.co.uk) 20th July 2023.
- 140. See Christopher Lamb, 'Pope apologises to Comboni survivors' (thetablet.co.uk) 13th June 2022.
- 141. At least sixteen diocesan reports prepared within the Synod process covered the impact of abuse on people's confidence in Church leaders and on the moral authority of the Church. They described a sense of immense damage as well as concern at the apparent lack of support for survivors and the lack of sorrow and humility in response. See also the National Synthesis for England and Wales For a Synodal Church: Communion, Participation, Mission Catholic Bishops' Conference (cbcew.org.uk) p.12 paras 31,32.
- 142. Janine Geske, 'Restorative Justice and the Sexual Abuse Scandal in the Catholic Church' in *Cardozo Journal of Conflict Resolution* Vol 8.2, (2007) 651-8.
- 143. Geske, pp. 654, 657.
- 144. Truth Project | IICSA Independent Inquiry into Child Sexual Abuse
- 145. Kate Jackson-Meyer, 'A Clergy Abuse Truth and Reconciliation Commission' in *Doing Theology and Theological Ethics in the face of the Abuse Crisis*, eds. Daniel J. Fleming, James F. Keenan SJ and Hans Zollner SJ. (Eugene, Oregon: Pickwick Publications/Wipf, 2023) 230-246.
- 146. See also A Proposal for a Clergy Abuse Truth and Reconciliation Commission Feasibility Study | Catholic Theological Ethics in the World Church (catholicethics.com) 1st December 2023, where Jackson-Meyer develops this idea for the USA.
- 147. Catherine O'Connell and Barbara Walshe, A Restorative Response to the Abuse of Children Perpetrated by Joseph Marmion SJ Restorative-Response-to-the Abuse-of-Children-Perpetrated by-Joseph-Marmion-SJ-August-2023.pdf (jesuit.ie) p.7.
- 148. Salving the Vast Wounds that Remain.
- 149. O'Connell and Walshe, p.98.
- 150. O'Connell and Walshe, p.58 and p. 96.
- 151. The Isaiah Journey Catholic Bishops' Conference (cbcew.org.uk)
- 152. Healing-Garden.pdf (cbcew.org.uk) Guidelines for setting up other gardens are included.
- 153. Vade Mecum for the Synod on Synodality, Vademecum-EN-A4.pdf (synod.va) Appendix B, p.3.
- 154. National Synthesis, National Synthesis Catholic Bishops' Conference (cbcew.org.uk) p.7.
- 155. National Synthesis, p.7.
- 156. See Survivors Voices
- 157. There is an interesting example of lament in the Pastoral Plan which emerged from the Synod in the Archdiocese of Liverpool;see p.12 headed 'Signposts to the future: The Lament'. Synodality-Together on the road (liverpoolcathOlic.org.uk)
- 158. (New York: Orbis Books, 2016) p. 89. References following are from the same text.
- 159. The School for Synodality is working on this. See School for Synodality
- 160. Rafael Luciani described this practice in an online seminar organised by The Tablet on synodality and accountability on 13<sup>th</sup> September.2023. Luciani described how bishops in Latin America agreed to implement the pastoral vision which emerged in their meetings in CELAM, the continental gathering of bishops for Latin America and the Caribbean, even though CELAM had no canonical status. He also described a practice whereby bishops might make known their willingness to step down if their pastoral councils, after due process and when these structures at both parish and diocesan level are mature, think this is needed.
- 161. Charter for the Protection of Children and Young People | USCCB The Statement of Episcopal Commitment is included in the Charter booklet.
- 162. Wijlens, p.439.
- 163. Wijlens, p.438.
- 164. mn.catholic.org.au/people/clergy-and-parish-leaders-professional-support/
- 165. June 2022 Implementation Working Group Update Archdiocese of Vancouver (rcav.org)